

1 **PROVIDENCE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES**

2 **July 28, 2010, 6:00 p.m.**

3 **Providence City Office Building**

4 **15 South Main, Providence, UT 84332**

5  
6 **Chairman: G Busch**

7 **Commissioners: R Gustaveson, R Sneddon, S Flammer, D Briel**

8 **Excused:**

9 **Alternates: C Kirk, L Frank**

10  
11 **CONFLICT OF INTEREST:**

12  
13 **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:**

14 The Providence City Planning Commission will consider for approval the minutes of July 14, 2010.

15 **Motion to approve the minutes: S Flammer, R Sneddon**

16 **Vote: Yea: G Busch, R Gustaveson, R Sneddon, S Flammer, D Briel**

17 **Nay: None**

18 **Abstain: None**

19 **Excused: None**

20  
21 **ACTION ITEMS:**

22 **Item No. 1.** The Providence City Planning Commission will consider for recommendation to the City Council a request  
23 to amend the Land Use Authority and Conditions/Design Standards for Chapter 10-4-4 Mixed Use District, Commercial  
24 Highway District and Commercial General District.

25 S Bankhead and Max Pierce discussed last night's meeting. They met with Mark Cohen a developer that has worked in  
26 our City. He is rescuing a mixed use project in Draper.

27 S Bankhead asked him what the problems were with this project.

28 M Cohen said one of the problems is the town homes and the retail spaces in the front two buildings are very nice. The  
29 back two buildings are extremely limited to road access. He suggested the City look at other ordinances besides the  
30 mixed use such as parking and signage. Retail is very transient

31 S Bankhead suggested having Mark Cohen come talk to the Commission about these issues. She reminded the  
32 Commission what their duties and responsibilities are.

33 S Bankhead told the Commission that they need to look ahead to the future not just the hear and now.

34 G Busch said the imbalance of the retail that is already built bothers him. He understands why a developer wouldn't  
35 want to build anymore.

36 C Kirk said she wants as much commercial as possible. She understands where Amsource is coming from. The big  
37 picture with this development is mixed use.

38 R Sneddon said he believes all of Providence is mixed use.

39 D Briel said the City knows there is limited land for commercial development.

40 C Kirk said she thinks someone would be crazy to go behind Maceys and build retail. She believes they would be  
41 setting themselves up for failure.

42 D Briel said the numbers are a guess. He believes that retail would work behind Maceys.

43 S Bankhead said if you want to hang your hat on the projected traffic numbers you better look at 200 West.

44 S Flammer said she doesn't agree with the traffic numbers that they have been given.

45 C Kirk doesn't put her faith in the traffic numbers either. These numbers should be credible. They have done more  
46 research on this than the City has.

47 K Hawkins said transportation planning is hard to do. He can't say that the traffic counts are 100% correct. This is  
48 looking 30 years in the future. Logan in general is overbuilt. He talked about some developments near Disney World in  
49 Florida. For every 1 or 2 mixed use developments that work there are 8 or 9 that haven't. Mixed Use is designed to be  
50 used in urban environments. They are very expensive to build. If you really want mixed use in your City you need to  
51 really look at the whole City and decide where the most urban area is. He wants his retailers to survive. He needs high  
52 density residential to make his retail work. There is plenty of retail on the west side of Hwy 165. In 30 years the useful  
53 life for commercial and residential is finished. The market tells you what needs to go in the areas. Retail over residential  
54 has been a failure across the country. He needs density to make his development work. He doesn't like the arbitrary  
55 number he is forced to work with. Please reconsider the place for mixed use in the City.

56 K Hawkins wants the City to work with him on this. He will pay for a traffic study to be done on the new Spring Creek  
57 Parkway. He understands that the City is driven by sales tax. He just feels like the west side of Hwy 165 is where you  
58 want your commercial area.

1 D Calderwood asked if K Hawkins would come up with a percentage.  
2 K Hawkins said he doesn't feel like any percentage would work. There is only 4.6 acres to work with.  
3 T Herold talked to the Commission about the different areas that are available for mixed use. He went over the zoning  
4 map that was handed out at the joint workshop last night. The whole project is horizontal mixed use. He doesn't see this  
5 kind of zoning working. Multi-family has a net gain in property tax versus services. Mixed use projects develop in the  
6 urban core of a city. Providence's urban core is in the middle of the City.  
7 K Hawkins went over the new site plan that Amsource would like to create for the City. Retail dollars are made in  
8 November and December. Developers want parking and access. High density is 18-24 units. 200 units is the magic  
9 number. These will be very nice apartments. Open areas would be created around the units.  
10 R Sneddon asked what kind of construction they would use.  
11 K Hawkins said it would be brick, stucco and wood. It needs to look nice. He will not build junk.  
12 S Bankhead said if you are entertaining their idea and you start with multi-family that close to the highway that is all  
13 you will have in that area. Retailers look globally and our urban center will be generated around Wal-Mart and Maceys.  
14 River Heights is to the north of us and it is zoned mixed use at River Woods. If you put multi-family behind Maceys  
15 you will definitely close the door. She doesn't know if Envision Cache Valley has the same vision that Providence does.  
16 Their assumptions may have been based on how they think things should develop. If you want to save our agricultural  
17 areas you wouldn't want to run cars through there. The Commission needs to decide what they want to recommend to  
18 the Council.  
19 T Herold said he would suggest making a base mixed use ordinance on the books and hold on to it.  
20 K Hawkins said the general rule is for every acre of land you can build 10,000 feet of building. On Hwy 165 west of  
21 Maceys you have a million feet of building area. The City needs to look at this area.  
22 D Briel recommends that commercial land in the City is saved. He believes if we give up the land behind Maceys we  
23 will be sorry later. He believes traffic will increase on Spring Creek Parkway when that road is finished. He believes  
24 that is what we want for Providence? Do we want to look like Logan or do we want to stay unique?  
25 G Busch said you should look at the general plan. Our general plan is 20 years old. He is worried about how these 4  
26 acres will tie into the rest of the area.  
27 D Calderwood said that where Les Schwab is building is overbuilt. What kind of traffic count is on this road?  
28 K Hawkins said Wal-Mart will give them the business. Les Schwab did the research and decided that this piece of  
29 property works for them.  
30 T Herold said there is no commercial on 100 East, even though Main Street through Logan has been there forever. In 20  
31 or 30 years developments will be redeveloped.  
32 R Gustaveson asked where does it end if we let this 4 acres go.  
33 K Hawkins said if a study was done he doesn't think that a planner would pick anywhere in Providence for mixed use.  
34 C Kirk said she doesn't know if mixed use would work anywhere in the City.  
35 K Hawkins said you can't get to a certain point until you reach a certain number.  
36 S Bankhead said if you go along with C Kirk's train of thought you wouldn't get anymore commercial. There is a lot of  
37 demand for multi-family. You keep saying you want a general plan. You are the Planning Commission. You need to get  
38 a vision for the future of the City. You are the ones that this starts with.  
39 D Briel said there has been a lot of discussion on this but now we need to settle it.  
40 K Hawkins just wants to use his land the way he sees fit. He thinks the City needs to figure out what corridors they want  
41 to protect.  
42 S Flammer asked if crime rates go up with apartments.  
43 T Herold said you have a higher density to deal with.  
44 K Hawkins said in order to rent apartments you need amenities. He has no interest in low income apartments.  
45 G Busch said we keep the mixed use zoning at this location, keep mixed use as an opportunity in Providence just not at  
46 this area and then come back and rezone.  
47 R Sneddon suggested calling it a transitional zone.  
48 K Hawkins said leave it mixed use but let the market determine what will go there.  
49 T Herold said take out the percentages.  
50 D Briel said he believes that residential should be allowed but not forced.  
51 K Hawkins suggested going 80-20% but don't make it have to be retail. People will come to you for every single  
52 project. You will have complete control over what goes there.  
53 R Sneddon asked what if 18 units becomes 12.  
54 K Hawkins said it is less density. The higher density the better if your trying to make critical mass.  
55 S Bankhead said there is a lot of professional space. Multi-family gives the City more money. More professional space  
56 is not a good idea.  
57 C Kirk said she believes the Commission wants to have walking space. This sounds like a good idea.

1 D Calderwood said the Commission can do nothing and when the road is finished you can see what the traffic counts  
2 will be.  
3 R Gustaveson asked what light industrial would do. What kind of revenue does that give the City?  
4 K Hawkins said not much.  
5 K Hawkins said the City needs to update their master plan.  
6 S Flammer asked where the Alder's Property goes.  
7 S Bankhead said it is on the east side of Hwy 165.  
8 K Hawkins asked T Herold how much it would cost to update their master plan.  
9 T Herold said to re-do a general plan it is usually \$25,000 to \$100,000. Every community needs multi-family in their  
10 City. Communities are going to grow. You need to focus on where you want the density and what you want it to look  
11 like. You want the mix of housing.  
12 S Bankhead said there is no point to give a planner \$25,000 if the Commission won't agree to multi-family.  
13 D Briel said he believes if you keep it in house you can keep the cost down.  
14 T Herold said it is more of an education with the public. You need to give them a vision of what it looks like.  
15 S Bankhead said the Commission's job is to decide what the best use of the land is for the City. You need to give the  
16 City guidance as to where you want it to go.  
17 K Hawkins said people hardly ever show up when they agree with something. Government tends to let 20 or 30 people  
18 rule their decisions. In politics you will make one group happy and one group unhappy.  
19 C Kirk said there must be a reason why cities want high density.  
20 K Hawkins asked if the Commission would allow him 80-20% and not make it all retail he would agree with that. Then  
21 he will come back and rezone it. Buildings need to be a certain depth to make it work. Make the mixed use 18-24 units  
22 and 80% residential and 20% of whatever. He will have to come back and let the Commission know what he wants to  
23 do before it is allowed.

24 **Motion to table the action item until the 25<sup>th</sup> of August and bring it back as a study item and an action item:**  
25 **R Sneddon, S Flammer second**

26 S Bankhead said that she would have Jeff Gilbert and Josh Runhaar come to the next meeting and discuss this.  
27 K Hawkins would just like to make some progress.  
28 D Calderwood asked the Commission to allow him to walk the property. He suggested that all of them do this.  
29 K Hawkins said that flex space (light industrial) would work well here.

30 **Vote: Yea: G Busch, R Gustaveson, R Sneddon, S Flammer, D Briel**  
31 **Nay: None**  
32 **Abstain: None**  
33 **Excused: None**  
34

35 **STAFF REPORTS:**

36 S Bankhead told the Commission about the meeting with Chris & Sandra Checketts. Staff would like to wait on the  
37 Accessory Building Ordinance until they get some more direction. She is asking for 30 days before they come back with  
38 something. The sign ordinance was ready to go until Morgan City was sued for infringing on free speech. Staff is  
39 waiting to see how this law suit plays out.  
40

41 **COMMISSION REPORT:**

42 D Briel talked about the traffic counts and how they can change overnight.  
43 R Sneddon said that he understands that Amsource can have 60% and then come back in and ask for more later. He just  
44 wants the City to have control of development.  
45

46 **Motion to adjourn: S Flammer, D Briel second**

47 **Vote: Yea: G Busch, R Gustaveson, R Sneddon, S Flammer, D Briel**  
48 **Nay: None**  
49 **Abstain: None**  
50 **Excused: None**  
51

52 Meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.  
53 Minutes taken and prepared by Terri Lewis  
54  
55

56 \_\_\_\_\_  
57 Glen Busch, Chairman

\_\_\_\_\_ Terri Lewis